

2014

China in Transition: Jesuit Encounters with the Dying Qing Empire

Anthony E. Clark

Whitworth University, aclark@whitworth.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.whitworth.edu/historyfaculty>

 Part of the [Asian History Commons](#), [Chinese Studies Commons](#), [Cultural History Commons](#), [Diplomatic History Commons](#), and the [History of Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Clark, Anthony E. , "China in Transition: Jesuit Encounters with the Dying Qing Empire" Whitworth University (2014). *History Faculty Scholarship*. Paper 7.

<http://digitalcommons.whitworth.edu/historyfaculty/7>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the History at Whitworth University. It has been accepted for inclusion in History Faculty Scholarship by an authorized administrator of Whitworth University.

RICCI INSTITUTE LECTURE SERIES (2014)
(25 September 2014 – University of San Francisco – Inaugural Lecture)

LECTURE TITLE:

“China in Transition: Jesuit Encounters with the Dying Qing Empire”

PRESENTER:

Anthony E. Clark, Ph.D., Associate Professor of Chinese History (Whitworth University)

LECTURE ABSTRACT:

When four French Jesuits first encountered China in the late 1800s, they were unexpectedly swept into the turbulence of a dying empire. In this lecture, Dr. Anthony Clark, considers what it was like to be a Jesuit missionary in China as the Qing empire erupted into the violent Boxer Uprising of 1900. Living in what is today called Hebei, these missionaries struggled to learn Chinese and adjust to Chinese culture, while also maintaining their relationships with their families back in Europe. Dr. Clark will also discuss his recent travels to where these Jesuits lived and died in 1900.

When Sts. Rémi Isoré, SJ, and Paul Denn, SJ, traveled by boat to China in the late nineteenth century they wrote hymns they hoped to rewrite in Chinese, and tender poems to their relatives who remained in France. They, like all of their Jesuit confrères who were assigned to China during the final years of the Qing (1644-1911), are well known for their missionary work in China, but little is known about the personalities they presented to the people they encountered day after day. Based on exhaustive research at the Jesuit archives at Vanves, France, and in China, this talk provides an introduction to the very human lives of China’s four Jesuit saints, Paul Denn, Léon-Ignace Mangin, Rémi Isoré, and Modeste Andlauer. Using newly-discovered historical photographs and examples from private letters, this remembrance of China’s Jesuit saints examines how the Society of Jesus preserved, celebrated, and promoted the exemplary lives of these four men as they encountered China during its most turbulent era of transition.

Lecture:

*** Thank you:** *Fr. Antoni Ucerler*
 Dr. Wu Xiaoxin
 The Ricci Institute
 USF

*** One of the first lines I learned when I began my study of Classical Chinese was “有朋自遠方來，不亦樂乎。” – Seeing good friends after a long absence is still one of my chief pleasures; Confucius was right.**

[SLIDE 1: Title Slide]

*** NOTE – One of the things I like most about this print, made shortly after the Boxer Uprising to commemorate the Jesuits who had died, is that most of the people featured are Chinese. [Actually, the four French Jesuits in the image also look Chinese to me.] It somewhat worries me that most of my remarks today will be about European Jesuits in China; in the future I hope other scholars – including myself – will write more about China’s Chinese Christians who lived during the end of the Qing empire.**

[SLIDE 2: St. Ignatius of Loyola, Spiritual Exercises, St. Francis Xavier] In the

Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556), the exercitant is exhorted to fight against desolation of heart; she or he is reminded to be patient and look forward to the consolation to come. “Let him who is in desolation strive to persevere in patience,” St. Ignatius writes, “and let him think that he will be speedily consoled.”¹ Jesuit missionaries went to China only after making the Spiritual Exercises, and words such as these, as well as admonitions to be well prepared for spiritual conflict, were undoubtedly fresh in the minds of these confrères as they endured seasickness and storms on their voyage to the Celestial Empire. We scholars seem to focus obsessively on the scientific, Catholic, and Jesuit aspects of the histories of these missionaries to China, but while they did spend long hours “exercising the spirit,” we should remember that these men were

also sons of worried parents, siblings to brothers and sisters who wept at their departure ceremonies, and they held interests that are rarely discussed in scholarly works and hagiographies.

When I was asked to give this talk I wondered if there is anything about Jesuits in China that has not been already said, and it came to mind that the Society's China mission has been depicted as a "larger than life" enterprise; they were "a generation of giants," wrote Fr. George Dunne, SJ, who lived in "the days of glory [that] lay far in the past."² I wondered what these Jesuits did when they weren't being "giants" – who were these giants when they were just being men? To answer this question I drew on the lives of the only four China Jesuits so far who are canonized saints in the Catholic Church – the tallest of the giants. Was there something in the legacies of these saints that can be identified as "real lives"? Oscar Wilde once quipped that, "One's real life is often the life that one does not lead."³ Given the nature of hagiographies one might think Wilde is correct, but if we dig a little deeper we can find out more about the more diurnal lives of China's four Jesuit saints, and I think that what makes them visibly saints is better illustrated when we look into what is not included in the embroidered narratives found within hagiographies.

First Steps - Preparations

[SLIDE 3: Names & Print of the Four Jesuit Saints of China] When commenting on the Jesuit character, Honoré de Balzac (1799-1850) said that, ". . . they renounce the present for the future, looking forward only to a hereafter in Heaven."⁴ He also mentions the Society's dogged commitment to Christian charity; but again, we hear nothing of their relationships and personal difficulties beneath their patina of missionary zeal. The Jesuit

archive in Vanves, in the southwestern suburbs of Paris, contains the personal papers of these four Jesuit saints who died in China, including a great deal of correspondence between them and their families. [SLIDE 4: St. Rémi Isoré] Few people know, for example, that Rémi Isoré's (1852-1900) brother was also a priest, and that his sister was a Daughter of Charity. By nineteen, he entered the seminary at the commercial town of Cambrai, famous for its cathedral with an icon of Our Lady of Grace. After joining the Jesuits in 1875, Isoré began considering a mission; China was not his first choice. He asked his provincial if he could go to Zambia, Africa. The provincial instead sent Rémi to China in 1882, about which he later wrote: "A kind of resentment had slipped into my heart."⁵ His first steps into China were actually steps of bitterness. China was not where he wanted to be, but his letters home show a man determined to overcome his resentment and set himself to the task of being a missionary.

[SLIDE 5: St. Paul Denn] Paul Denn (1847-1900) lived through a painful childhood; he lost his father when he was only two years old, his mother lost two children while they were still very young, and Paul was expected to help his mother support and raise his remaining siblings.⁶ Among his other jobs before entering the Society of Jesus, Denn worked in a bank from the age of fourteen. According to sources, he was extremely attached to his mother, whose piety influenced his decision to join the Jesuits in 1872, and after only a few weeks into his novitiate Paul Denn was told he would soon leave for China.⁷ We might pause here remember that his likelihood of dying during travel or from illness was then around fifty percent. [SLIDE 6: St. Modeste Andlauer] Modeste Andlauer (1847-1900) was born in France's Alsace region, and was raised speaking French and German. So after entering the Society in 1872, he was assigned to teach

German at Amiens, Lille, Brest, and England, where his provincial informed him, quite by surprise, that he would leave for China in 1882.⁸ He asked to see his family before setting sail in September, and Andlauer was allowed to return to his native Rosheim, where he rendered his final goodbye to his parents, Joseph and Barbara, who operated a popular bakery next to the City Hall.

[SLIDE 7: St. Léon-Ignace Manjin] Léon-Ignace Mangin's father was a judge, which reportedly intimidated his acquaintances, and he was also a very tall and imposing person, which was also intimidating to his acquaintances.⁹ But despite his daunting family provenance and commanding stature, he was described as "reserved and kindly" toward his brother Jesuits and those he had befriended.¹⁰ Like Isoré, Denn, and Andlauer, Mangin was reportedly taken aback when his provincial notified him in 1882 that he would join his confrères at the Jesuit mission in Xianxian, China.¹¹ As we consider the backgrounds, personalities, and personal desires of each of these four men, we see that all were gentle souls, but none expected, or even desired, to go to China. Horace is said to have written that, "Life is largely a matter of expectation." If this is so, then these four men were not exactly living their expectations. But then, they had read the Exercises, and if there was no such thing as desolation in the Christian life, then St. Ignatius would not have mentioned it. Once in China, all four began a process of uneasy adjustment, during which they formed new attachments, while making heroic efforts to retain their old attachments with their families back in France.

Uneasy Steps - Adjustments

[SLIDE 8: Group Photo, Xianxian Missionaries with Bishop Henri-Joseph Bulté, CM – Andlauer is 2/row, 2/from the right] Our four Jesuits were assigned to what must

have seemed to them like a remote backwater. Beijing and Shanghai were much larger centers of Catholic activity than where they began their missions at Xianxian. Even more, their bishop, Henri-Joseph Bulté, was a Vincentian, a member of the Order that had replaced the Jesuits after they were suppressed in the mid-eighteenth century and withdrawn from China. All Jesuit properties were “inherited” by the Vincentians, and when the Jesuits began their return into China, the Vincentians were not ready to part with their inheritance. In addition to being swept into this old rivalry between French Vincentians and French Jesuits, these new missionaries wrote often about the difficulties of cultural adjustment, such as using chopsticks, but nothing presented more of a struggle than learning Chinese. Their letters home to France centered mostly on catching up with family matters, keeping up with favorite hobbies, and what they called the “curse of Chinese tones and characters.”

[SLIDE 9: Isoré – Poem and Musical Score] Rémi Isoré’s personal papers include examples of two of his great passions: writing poetry, in both French and Latin, and numerous examples of original music scores, some accompanied by tender lyrics.¹² I don’t think that his compositions will replace Johann Sebastian Bach (1685-1750), but they are fine pieces that, as far as I know, have never been performed. [SLIDE 10: Denn – Chinese Characters & Poem to His Sister] Among the more moving items located in Paul Denn’s collected papers in France is an affectionate poem he mailed to his sister, Sophie, before her wedding day. While it does not rhyme in English translation, it serves to illustrate the warmth he felt for his sister.

To my Sister

What can signify young girl
All these celebratory preparations?

This white outfit
And this ring that shines
On your slender finger?
Why such a troubled air
On your angelic face?
Ah, it is that presently
You will unite your destiny
To the one who soon,
In joyful air,
Will call himself your husband
Your comfort, your support:
How this thought is sweet
To your heart, full of his:
Be happy with him,
And may he be your strength.
May your posterity be
Good and sweet like you,
Find in God, a true Faith,
And in your heart charity.
May it one day give you
The gentleness and love
That you had for your mother,
For your sister, and your brother.

Paul Denn¹³

In addition to this poem, Denn's later letters home from China include explanations of the meaning and uses of Chinese characters, along with long descriptions of Chinese culture. Matteo Ricci (1552-1610), who showed great appreciation for Chinese writing, admitted with some frustration in his private journal, that Chinese "is diametrically opposed to our own" writing.¹⁴ Regardless of their respect for Chinese, Denn and his fellow Jesuits struggled bitterly to master this language during their first years in China.

[SLIDE 11: Andlauer – Wuyi Residence & Example of His Sketch Book]

Modeste Andlauer recorded his initial impressions of China in an annotated sketchbook of what he saw during his first encounters with the Middle Kingdom. His first view of China was of Shanghai in November, 1882, and his first notes are attempts to write

Chinese characters beside drawings of pagodas and Chinese roofs.¹⁵ After his assignment to Wuyi in 1893, Andlauer moved into a Chinese-style residence and became the pastor of one of the few Chinese-style churches in Zhili. By then Andlauer had grown enthusiastic about his life in China, and his small chapel at Wuyi was modeled after indigenous Chinese temples. Even though he enjoyed his new home and his new Chinese friendships, Andlauer's letters suggest an enduring homesickness. In one letter he wrote, "If from time to time one has an opportunity to suffer, we must say, war is war, or rather, a mission is a mission; or better to say you came on your mission to enjoy suffering. Ask God for me, dear Victor, the grace to accept generously the little sufferings that are sometimes met along the road of a missionary."¹⁶

[SLIDE 12: Women with Bound Feet] His homesickness did not make Andlauer withdraw from the realities of life in China, however; he actually became something of a social activist after discovering the details of Chinese footbinding. One of the women attached to his parish at Wuyi lived too far away to make it to every Sunday Mass, but after being encouraged to endure the painful process of unbinding her feet, she was able to attend Sunday Masses.¹⁷ Andlauer was eager to use any of his persuasive powers to help end this crippling practice. If God had wanted women's feet to be so small, he suggested, he would have created them that way. Christian missionaries at the end of the empire had promoted a return to what they called, "*tianzu*," 天足 or "natural feet." To the Catholic missionary, such as Andlauer, this could also suggest "Heavenly feet," or feet in the shape of God's original design. As Dorothy Ko puts it, "The doctrine of Heavenly feet is thus predicated on the construction of a God-given natural body." The Wuyi woman who unbound her feet walked twenty miles to get to Sunday Mass.¹⁸

[SLIDE 13: Mangin – letter to his brother, Paul] While Andlauer continued to bereave the distance of his family, Léon-Ignace Mangin appears to have better adjusted to his new life in China, though he, too, struggled to attain proficiency in speaking and reading Chinese. In a letter to his brother, Paul, Mangin included examples of the Chinese graphs he still labored to understand after seven years in China. And in a letter to his mother written in 1888, after six years of Chinese study, Léon-Ignace wrote, “Dear mom, I still cannot understand what they say . . . and my [Chinese] expressions still sound too French.” He also expressed his concern over the changing political situation in China at that time: “We live day to day,” he said, “not knowing what will happen tomorrow.”¹⁹ While these four men were still learning Chinese, making new Chinese friends, and adjusting to Chinese food, the China they were getting to know was in transition. It was experiencing, as Xiang Lanxin put it, “tumultuous events that led to the war” between China and the West; by the summer of 1900, more than 30,000 Chinese Christians would die from Boxer violence, and an unknown number, perhaps equally as high, of Boxers and Qing (1644-1911) troops had would also die from foreign vengeance.²⁰

Desolation

By May 1900, in the wake of a series of internal rebellions and growing tensions with aggressive Western forces carving China into “spheres in influence,” the Manchu court in Beijing committed itself to make a last stand for political survival. The Jesuit Fathers, Isoré, Denn, Andlauer, and Mangin, were about to confront the turbulence of the Boxer Uprising, and the death of imperial China. [SLIDE 14: Jesuit Resistance – Boxer Uprising] Chinese imperial troops and a popular militia of displaced peasants, known as

the Boxers, began a summer of destruction and killing that approached the Jesuit mission in Xianxian by June of 1900.²¹ The Jesuits there decided to resist along side their fellow Chinese Christians. In the mission area of Southeast Zhili alone, fifteen Catholic fortresses were erected with an army of Chinese Christians and Jesuit commanders armed with rifles, cannon, swords, and spears.²² None of our four Jesuits survived; Modeste Andlauer and Rémi Isoré both died in the Jesuit church at the small village of Wuyi; Léon-Ignace Mangin and Paul Denn were killed along with nearly 3,000 other Chinese Christians in Zhujiahe Catholic village. This was, as St. Ignatius of Loyola had written of in his Exercises, a period of desolation.

[SLIDE 15: Boxer and Red Lantern] I should say something here about who these Boxers were – this will help us better understand the very religious nature of the movement. The term, “Boxers,” is actually a Western term to describe the large numbers of young men and women who had started forming local martial arts clubs after droughts had left tens of thousands of peasants without work – and also, largely, without food. These units gathered at popular temples to worship powerful Chinese deities, watch opera performances featuring Chinese heroes, and practice traditional martial arts. The Chinese who joined these units divided into two separate groups: the men formed into what they called the “Society for Righteous Harmony” (義和團), and the women created a female society called the “Red Lanterns” (紅燈). They shared three general characteristics. First, they believed that the foreign God was the cause of the droughts that had afflicted northern China. Second, they believed that the popular Chinese deities they worshipped would restore the rains if the foreigners and Chinese Christians were eliminated. And third, they believed that those deities could be summoned to possess their bodies, which

would render the Boxers invincible to bullets or any other weapon.

Chinese sources provide examples of all three of these beliefs. One Boxer placard in northern China made the following announcement:

The dieties help us fighters, the Fists of Righteous Harmony, as the foreign devils have disturbed the central plains. They force their religion and only believe in Heaven [viz., the Lord of Heaven]. They don't believe in our dieties or the Buddha, and they neglect their ancestors. Their men are improper and their women immoral. . . . The heavens won't rain and the earth is scorched, and all because of the foreign devils, the skies are blocked.²³

The message was clear; their God had caused the drought, and once they are gone the rain will return. A long description by the Shanxi literatus, Liu Dapeng (1857-1943), provides one of the best examples of the Boxer possession ritual, which they expected would help them expel these “foreign devils.” The Boxers began by making incense offerings to the deities along with prostrations – and then:

Suddenly they raised their gaze and then dropped to the ground as if in a sound sleep. Before long their hands and feet began to undulate. They stood erect and danced around with a fierce expression, their eyes shut so tightly they could not be opened. Then they made fists and claw shapes with their hands, leaping and rushing around.²⁴

After completing these rites, the Boxers were held to be completely protected by the possessing deity; as the motto read, “*Dao qiang bu ru*,” or 刀槍不入 “Blades and bullets cannot enter.” The admixture of this sense of invincibility, hatred for foreigners, and hunger, made them a fearsome challenge to the Jesuit attempts to preserve their Christian

communities in Xianxian.

[SLIDE 16: Wuyi Incident] Andlauer was warned by local Chinese Catholics to leave Wuyi and seek refuge in one of the fortified Jesuit strongholds, but he refused to abandon his church and his flock. On the evening of June 17, Father Isoré went to Andlauer's residence in Wuyi, perhaps to persuade his friend to flee to safety; but by the time Isoré was with Andlauer, Wuyi Village was completely surrounded by Boxers. At 6:00 pm the next day, both priests heard the approach of a large crowd carrying weapons. They ran into the church and prayed at the foot of the altar while the Boxers broke through the front door and beheaded the two Jesuits. On June 20, a Chinese Christian went to Zhujiahe Village and told Fathers Mangin and Denn about the deaths of their two friends at Wuyi.²⁵ They also became aware that Zhujiahe was the next target. [SLIDE 17: Zhujiahe Incident] When the massive numbers of displaced peasants had earlier begun to form into Boxer units, Zhujiahe only had 300 Chinese Catholics. From May to June, more than 3,000 refugees had relocated to the village, and had fortified the walls in preparation for an armed defense. On July 18, a combined force of Boxers and Qing troops attacked the wall, and by the 20th they broke through the ramparts. Seven children who witnessed the violence were later interviewed – it was fierce.

During the previous days, Fathers Mangin and Denn remained awake, with no sleep at all, to hear Confessions and offer Masses; they exhausted themselves preparing the villagers for what befell them. After killing some 2,000 defenders, a remnant of 1,000 women, children, and elderly had crowded into the small village church; Mangin and Denn led them in prayer when, around eight o'clock in the morning, the attackers shot through the front door and windows at the Christians inside. Jean-Paul Wiest describes

well the final moments in the church after the shooting had ended: “. . . some Boxers blocked the entrance with mattresses soaked in kerosene and set them on fire. The flames rapidly reached the reed matting which formed the ceiling. The people trapped in the church soon died of smoke inhalation.”²⁶ These two missionaries had grown so close to their Chinese friends that one woman stood in front of Father Mangin and spread her arms to receive the bullets aimed at him. After it was all over, a Jesuit travelled to the village to photograph the skeletal remains of those who had perished in the church.

Consolation

[SLIDE 18: Li Wenyu and Pierre-Xavier Mertens] In the aftermath of this calamity, two priests were dispatched to collect records and eyewitness testimonies about what had happened to the missionaries and Christians who died at Wuyi and Zhujahe; one was the Chinese publisher from Shanghai, Li Wenyu (1840-1911), and the other was the French missionary, Pierre-Xavier Mertens. [SLIDE 19: *Quanhuo ji* and *Du sang chretien sur le Fleuve Juane*] Li later published one of the most exhaustive accounts of the Boxer Uprising, his *Record of the Boxer Calamity* (*Quanhuo ji* 拳禍記), and Mertens wrote what became a popular book on the Boxer violence in Zhili, his *Christian Blood in the Yellow River* (*Du sang chretien sur le Fleuve Jaune*). These were challenging works to write; as the Catholic theologian, Paul J. Griffiths, has said, “Among the hardest things in the world to do is thinking and writing about a difficult topic.”²⁷ Li Wenyu and Pierre-Xavier Mertens both had in mind a kind of consolation, one that would, they hoped, cast a more agreeable patina on the violent deaths of the Jesuit missionaries and Chinese Christians under their care during the Boxer era. Namely, both Li and Mertens wished that some of these victims would someday be recognized as saints.

While Mertens wrote much about his European confreres - Isoré, Denn, Andlauer, and Mangin – Li Wenyu clearly wished to underscore the saintliness of his fellow Chinese. Li, in his book, assigns far more miracles to Chinese Christians than he does to European ones. After narrating what happened at Zhujiahe, Li Wenyu writes that Fathers Zhou and Pan at the nearby village, Qingcaohe, believed the Boxers to be possessed by demons. So they made the Sign of the Cross toward them, after which “the Boxers witnessed a wind and ran away.” During their second attack, the Boxers “shot bullets that fell on them like rain, but not a single [Christian] was injured.”²⁸ [SLIDE 20: Beatification Ceremony, 1955] Many more miracles are recorded in both books, and in 1955 their efforts to draw attention to the Jesuits who died in Zhili paid off – the four Jesuits who had come from France, struggled with their Chinese, and wrote long, moving letters to their families, were beatified on April 17 by Pope Pius XII (1876-1958). The Jesuits paid all costs for the ceremony, and they orchestrated a grand celebration in the Vatican’s most illustrious space, St. Peter’s Basilica.

[SLIDE 21: Beatification – Saints Painting, Ceremony, and Flower Presentation]

A painting of the Jesuits who died at Wuyi and Zhujiahe was placed in Bernini’s famous Holy Spirit window in St. Peter’s. As the Pope pronounced the words of beatification, the painting was revealed as a curtain was slowly drawn apart. The huge basilica was spilling over with exultant Jesuits, including missionaries who had lived in China most of their lives, until their expulsion in 1950; and a Chinese priest stood with the Superior General as a large arrangement of flowers was presented to the pope.²⁹ After this extravagant ceremony, both the Jesuits and China gained enormous attention in Western Europe. Forty-five years later, these same four men who died in Zhili were canonized saints by

Pope John-Paul II (1920-2005) at St. Peter's Square, as it is called – It's not actually a "square."

Following the Footsteps – The Blood of the Martyrs

Two weeks before Christmas, in 2011, I travelled to Wuyi and Zhujiahe with the pastors of those two villages. Passing by fields of crops, walls covered in painted slogans, and newly-built factories billowing out the black smoke of "economic progress," I finally arrived at the small chapels of these two communities. The two priests told me that I was the first Westerner to visit these villages in living memory, and I was lavishly welcomed with banquets and gifts. I had read the documents about the more than 3,000 Christians who died there over a century ago, and as a professor of late-imperial Chinese history I was aware of the tensions between the Qing court and Western powers that helped fuel the violence of 1900. [SLIDE 22: Wuyi Catholic Church in 2011] One often reads in America that Chinese Catholics have no freedom to honor those canonized by Pope John-Paul II in 2000; this is not true. To be sure, there are still political sensitivities regarding Christianity in China today, but in Wuyi and Zhujiahe the local Chinese Catholics openly and proudly celebrate their saints. Father Luo, the pastor at Wuyi, has erected two pavilions, one commemorating St. Modeste Andlauer, and another to honor St. Remi Isoré. Inside the small chapel, he has displayed their portraits, and after drawing me inside he recounted the entire story of their deaths during the Boxer Uprising. For the Catholics at Wuyi, these two Jesuit missionaries represent the possibility of friendship between China and the West, and the possibility for faith to heal the wounds of conflict, and the anxieties of social change.

[SLIDE 23: Zhujiahe Village – Stone Monument and Mrs. Zhu] My book on

Catholic martyrdom during the Qing dynasty had just been published when I made this trip, so the events of Zhujiahe were still fresh in my mind when I arrived there in cold December. After photographing the remaining monuments related to the Catholic history of the village, I met with Lucia Zhu, the great granddaughter of St. Mary Zhu, the woman who stood in front of Léon-Ignace Mangin to receive the bullets intended for him; Lucia gave me an image of her ancestor who perished in the village church in 1900. She told me that one of her relatives hid in the sorghum fields during the massacre of the villagers, and that six other survivors passed down the stories of what happened. [SLIDE 24: Presentation of the Holy Relic/Bone] Among the more moving experiences I had while visiting Zhujiahe was receiving one of the human remains left in the village after the Qing militia and Boxer attack; Lucia Zhu's son, a cotton farmer, presented me with a large bone of one of the martyrs.

This particular relic deserves a brief explanation: During the siege a Catholic woman named Paula Wang had gathered a group of women to hide in the girls' orphanage, but as the attack grew more intense, Paula decided to lead the women in a defense. They covered their faces with black ink, put on white gowns, sashes, and turbans. Then they armed themselves with simple "kitchen knives and pruning knives from the barn," and rushed out to attack the Boxers.³⁰ They were quickly killed, though some women fled the violence by jumping into the village well; the fifty-eight women who jumped into the well were heard screaming for two days after the siege.³¹ It was the bone from one of these women that was given to me at Zhujiahe.

[SLIDE 25: The New Zhujiahe Church] But to return to what St. Ignatius of Loyola wrote of desolation and consolation: the villagers of Zhujiahe gave me a tour of

their new church, then under construction. The church that was built after 1900 was again destroyed by Red Guards in 1966, during the uneasy years of the Cultural Revolution (1966-1976). Zhujiahe's new pastor, Father Zhang, had negotiated with the local authorities to rebuild the church, and the Party agreed to largely fund its reconstruction. The new church now towers above the surrounding buildings, a sign to the villagers that those who died there a century ago will continue to be remembered by their descendants who survived two eras of sweeping transition in China. Only eleven years after the Boxer Uprising, imperial China had ended, and the contest between the Communists and nationalists inaugurated another era of change. [SLIDE 26: Christ the King Church - Hebei] While Mao Zedong (1893-1976) and Chang Kai-shek (1887-1975) contended for sovereignty over a war-ridden country, the Catholic community of Zhili – now Hebei – developed a culture of its own, one increasingly dedicated to the popular Catholic representation of Christ the King. This image echoes St. Ignatius of Loyola's reminder that consolation follows desolation; the Jesuits taught them this message after their era of suffering in 1900. Even as the empire was dying, it seemed also then that the Church would die. The churches in Wuyi and Zhujiahe are in fact growing, and they are, as far as I could tell, vibrant with optimism.

[SLIDE 27: Sanjiang (Wenzhou) Church and Destruction] This new Christian optimism has created new tensions in China. Five months ago, as Zhujiahe's Christians enjoyed Mass in their new church, *The Telegraph* reported on a much more numerous and well known Christian community at Wenzhou's Sanjiang village, that helplessly watched as local officials brought bulldozers to demolish their massive new church.³² In more economically prosperous and influential Wenzhou, a growing number of churches

have been closed or demolished in recent months as conflicts have emerged between China's more assertive Christian community and the country's state officials who are anxiously trying to maintain some semblance of the political status quo. On the other side of this coin, I should note that around the area where Isoré, Denn, Andlauer, and Mangin died in 1900, Catholics are enjoying a Party support that has given them many new churches and restored old ones. Hebei's Christians wisely insist that it is difficult to know what will happen to them. Laozi said that, "Those who have knowledge don't make predictions, and those who make predictions don't have knowledge."

Conclusion

In 1925, the Superior General of the Jesuits sent Father Pierre-Xavier Mertens to visit Wuyi and Zhujiahe to discern the status of these two Jesuit missions. When he entered the new village church, twenty-five years after Paul Denn and Léon-Ignace Mangin had died in the previous one, a banner still hung above the altar that read, "Sǐzhě ānxí," 死者安息 or, "May the dead rest in peace."³³ And flanking the two sides of the nave were twelve panels that recorded 1,800 of the known names of those who died in 1900. When I met with the current bishop of what is now Hengshui Diocese, Peter Feng Xinmao, he allowed me to see the historic items held in his private "museum." Among the objects preserved there are the panels of from Zhujiahe with the names of the 1900 victims, and fragments of the rosaries and holy medals that were recovered from the remains of those who died in the village. Bishop Feng said that the situation is still too complicated to open this museum to the public; the old Jesuit mission in Xianxian, and the saints I've discussed here are still politically sensitive topics in Hebei.

[SLIDE 28: Mao Button over Crucifix] I better understood the bishop's words

while visiting Panjiayuan Antique Market in Beijing, where Catholic crucifixes are sold beside red Chairman Mao pins. Whenever I discuss the history of missionaries in China, such as Isoré, Denn, Andlauer, and Mangin, I often think of a poem by the Song (960-1279) statesman, Su Dongpo (1037-1101), in which he lamented how difficult it is to depict Mount Lu in writing. The craggy cliffs are too complex to describe, especially the closer to them you become.

橫看成嶺側成峰

遠近高低各不同

只緣身在此山中

未識廬山真面目

Héng kàn chéng lǐng cè chéng fēng

yuǎnjìn gāodī gè bùtóng

zhǐ yuán shēn zài cǐ shānzhōng

wèi shí Lúshān zhēn miàn mù.

Gazing horizontally at its ridges, one imagines its peak,

Near and far, high and low, all are different,

Since you stand in the middle of the mountain,

You cannot see the true face of Mount Lu.

Whatever the political and religious landscape is, and was, in China, these four Jesuits are reminders of our shared humanity. We all struggle to adjust to new situations, new cultures, new friendships, and sometimes, new enemies. Despite distance from their families, their friends in Europe, and their feelings of loneliness in China, these four missionaries had read the words of their predecessor, Matteo Ricci, who wrote in his

popular *Essay on Friendship* (交友論): 友之與我，雖有二身，二身之內，其心一而已 *Yǒu zhī yǔ wǒ, suī yǒu èr shēn, èr shēn zhī nèi, qí xīn yī éryī*, “Although a friend and I may be of two bodies, within those two bodies there is but one heart.”³⁴

Additional Slides:

SLIDE 29: “Additional Images”

SLIDE 30: Post-Boxer Jesuit Propaganda – Resistance Group, Canon, and Boy on Canon

SLIDE: 31: Zhujia Reparation Ceremony, Zhujiahe Caskets, Crypt for Human Remains

SLIDE 32: Zhujia Church (1963), Zhujia Church Ruins (1900), Zhujiahe New Church Plan

SLIDE 33: Recording the Oral History of Lucia Zhu

SLIDE 34: A. Clark Visiting with Lucia Zhu

SLIDE 35: A. Clark with Lucia Zhu’s Son – Head of Zhujiahe Catholics

SLIDE 36: Gate to Old Zhujiahe Church, New and Old Monuments

SLIDE 37: Wuyi Pavillions Dedicated to Sts. Isoré and Andlauer

SLIDE 38: Images of Wuyi Catholics

Notes:

¹ Ignatius of Loyola, *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola*, Transl. by W. H. Longridge (London: A. R. Mowbray, 1950), 188.

² George H. Dunne, SJ, *Generation of Giants: The Story of the Jesuits in China in the Last Decades of the Ming Dynasty* (London: Burns & Oats, 1962), 11.

³ Oscar Wilde, *The Writings of Oscar Wilde* (London: Keller-Farmer, 1907), 150.

⁴ Quoted in Anthony E. Clark, *China's Saints: Catholic Martyrdom during the Qing (1644-1911)* (Bethlehem: Lehigh University Press, 2011), 89.

⁵ Bartley Schmitz, SVD, *Four Jesuits Martyred in China in the Twentieth Century* (Taipei: Taiwan Roman Catholic Bishops Committee, 2000), 10-11.

⁶ See “Généologie de la famille du Peère Denn,” Paul Denn Files, Archives de la Province de France de la Compagnie de Jésus, Vanves. Also see Schmitz, *Four Jesuits Martyred in China*, 5.

⁷ See Taiwan Roman Catholic Bishops Committee, Eds. 天主教臺灣地區主教團宣聖委員會, *Zhonghua xundao shengren zhuan 中華殉道聖人傳* (Biographies of China's Saints) (Taipei 台北: Tianzhujiao jiaowu xiejinhui chubanshe 天主教教務協進會出版社, 2000), 304-305.

⁸ Schmitz, *Four Jesuits Martyred in China*, 8.

⁹ *Zhonghua xundao shengren zhuan*, 302.

¹⁰ *Zhonghua xundao shengren zhuan*, 303.

¹¹ Clark, *China's Saints*, 101.

¹² See Remi Isoré Files, Archives de la Province de France de la Compagnie de Jésus, Vanves.

¹³ I am grateful to my colleague, Professor Bendi Schrambach, for this translation.

¹⁴ Matteo Ricci, *China in the Sixteenth Century: The Journals of Matthew Ricci: 1583-1610*, Transl. Louis J. Gallagher, SJ (New York: Random House, 1953), 29.

¹⁵ See Modeste Andlauer Files, Archives de la Province de France de la Compagnie de Jésus, Vanves.

¹⁶ Letter to Victor Fischer, 13 July 1888: “Si de temps à autre il se présente une occasion de souffrir. Il faut se dire, à la guerre comme à la guerre, ou plutôt: en mission comme en

mission; ou mieux encore de dire: tu es venu en mission non pour jouir mais pour souffrir. Demandez pour moi au Bon Dieu, cher Victor, la grâce de pouvoir accepter généreusement les petites souffrances qui se rencontrent parfois dur le chemin du missionnaire.” Modeste Andlauer Files, Archives de la Province de France de la Compagnie de Jésus, Vanves. Fischer

¹⁷ Pierre-Xavier Mertens, SJ, *The Yellow River Runs Red: A Story of Modern Chinese Martyrs*, Trans. Beryl Pearson (St. Louis: Herder, 1939), 20-21

¹⁸ Mertens, SJ, *The Yellow River Runs Red*, 21.

¹⁹ Léon-Ignace Mangin, letter to his mother, 25 March 1888. Léon-Ignace Mangin Files, Archives de la Province de France de la Compagnie de Jésus, Vanves.

²⁰ Xiang Lanxin, *The Origins of the Boxer War: A Multinational Study* (London: Routledge, 2003), 356.

²¹ Jean-Paul Wiest, “Catholic Images of the Boxers,” *The American Asian Review*, Vol. 9, No. 3 (Fall 1991): 45.

²² See R. G. Tiedemann, “The Church Militant: Armed Conflicts between Christians and Boxers in North China,” in *The Boxers and the World*, Eds. Robert Bickers and R. G. Tiedemann (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2007), 23.

²³ Taiyuan Diocese Archive, Shanxi Boxer Announcement, Guangxu 26th Reign Year (1900), Notice 1. Also see Qiao Zhiqiang 喬志強, ed., *Yihetuan zai Shanxi diqu shiliao* 義和團在山西地區史料 [Historical Sources on Boxers in Shanxi] (Taiyuan 太原: Shanxi renmin chubanshe 山西人民出版社, 1980), 1.

²⁴ Liu Dapeng 劉大鵬, Qianyuan suoji 潛園瑣記 [Casual notes from within the garden], in Qiao Zhiqiang, *Yihetuan zai Shanxi diqu shiliao*, 28.

²⁵ See Clark, *China's Saints*, 92-99.

²⁶ Wiest, “Catholic Images of the Boxers,” 55.

²⁷ Paul J. Griffiths, *Intellectual Appetite: A Theological Grammar* (Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press, 2009), 7.

²⁸ Li Wenyu 李問漁 (Li Di 李杅), *Quanhuo ji* 拳禍記 (Shanghai 上海: Tushanwan yinshuguan 土山灣印書館, 1905), 152.

²⁹ See *Chine et Madagascar*, No. 52 (May 1955), signature between pp. 88 and 89.

³⁰ See Clark, *China's Saints*, 107, and Mertens, *The Yellow River Runs Red*, 44.

³¹ *Zhonghua xundao shengren zhuan*, 359.

³² See Tom Phillips, "China denies declaring war on Christians after mega-church is razed," *The Telegraph* (29 April 2014).

³³ Mertens, SJ, *The Yellow River Runs Red*, 61.

³⁴ Matteo Ricci, *On Friendship: One Hundred Maxims for a Chinese Prince*, Trans. Timothy Billings (New York: Columbia University Press, 2009), 90.