## Whitworth Digital Commons Whitworth University

History Faculty Scholarship

History

2011

The History of Ming-Qing Sino-Western Relations: Methods of Archival Research Using Missionary Collections with a Case Study of Taiyuan's Diocesan Records

Anthony E. Clark *Whitworth University,* aclark@whitworth.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.whitworth.edu/historyfaculty Part of the <u>Asian History Commons</u>, and the <u>Cultural History Commons</u>

## **Recommended** Citation

Clark, Anthony E., "The History of Ming-Qing Sino-Western Relations: Methods of Archival Research Using Missionary Collections with a Case Study of Taiyuan's Diocesan Records" Whitworth University (2011). *History Faculty Scholarship*. Paper 17. http://digitalcommons.whitworth.edu/historyfaculty/17

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the History at Whitworth University. It has been accepted for inclusion in History Faculty Scholarship by an authorized administrator of Whitworth University.

明清中西關係史:國內外傳教士檔案館研究情況與方法(太原)

# "The History of Ming-Qing Sino-Western Relations: Methods of Archival Research Using Missionary Collections with a Case Study of Taiyuan's Diocesan Records"<sup>1</sup>

By Anthony E. Clark, Ph.D. 柯學斌博士教授 (Whitworth University)

## Meeting:

"Cultural Encounters in the Central Plain Region of China: Social Changes and Christianity along the Mid-and-Lower Stream of the Yellow River"

## Organizer:

The Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History & Center for the Pacific Rim

#### Location/Date:

Henan University, Kaifeng, China (19-23 October 2011)

## Abstract

Today, perhaps more than ever, as China grows more active in global relations, scholars wish to better understand Sino-Western history, 中西關係史 and thus the academic community has begun searching for archival collections that can provide new insights on that history. Unfortunately, the predominance of scholarly works on Sino-Western relations have focused on sources held in academic libraries related to political and merchant activities, which only accounts for a small portion of information about China's long relationship with the West. Indeed, materials related to Sino-Western

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> I would like to acknowledge the following organizations and people for their important support of this work: The Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History, University of San Francisco; Henan University School of History and Culture; Minzu University of China; Whitworth University; the University of Oregon; the Archivio Segreto Vaticano; the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana; the Bibliothèque Nationale de France; the Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris Archive; the Congrègation de la Mission Archive; the Pontificium Institutum Missionum Exterarum Archive; the Franciscan Curia Archive; the Society of Jesus Archives (Rome & Vanves); the Shanghai Municipal Archive; the Xujiahui Library; the National Archives (Beijing), the National Central Library (Taipei); the Academia Sinica Archive; The Beijing Center Research Library; the Diocese of Tianjin, Xikai Cathedral; the Diocese of Taiyuan; Wu Xiaoxin; Li Jianhua; Zhang Liang; and Roberto Ribeiro, SJ. I should note here that all translations in this essay are my own unless otherwise stated.

relations are held in missionary archives that are seldom consulted. This paper confronts the significance, situation, and methodologies of accessing missionary archives inside and outside of China that hold records related to the Ming 明 (1368-1644) and Qing 清 (1644-1911) dynasties. The Diocesan Archive of Taiyuan, Shanxi, 太原山西省教區檔案 館 shall function as a specific case study of the complexities of locating and consulting missionary sources held in China today.

The first half of this paper shall discuss the importance of archival use, and introduce the present situation and method of accessing some of the world's more significant missionary archives outside of China: La Bibliothèque Nationale de France (Paris), the archive of the Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris (MEP, Paris), the archive of the Congrègation de la Mission (CM/Lazarists, Paris), the Archive of the Pontificium Institutum Missionum Exterarum (PIME, Rome), the archive of the Franciscan Curia (OFM, Rome), the archives of the Society of Jesus (SJ, Rome & Vanves), and the Papal and Secret Archives of the Vatican (Vatican City State). Inside of China, the more significant archival collections of Ming and Qing missionary documents are the Shanghai Municipal Archive 上海市檔案館 (Shanghai), the Xujiahui Library 徐 家匯圖書館 (Shanghai), and the holdings at the National Archives 國家圖書館北京 (Beijing), which holds the former contents of the Beitang Library 北堂圖書館. In addition to these collections, the National Central Library 國家圖書館台北 (Taipei) and the Academia Sinica Archive 中央研究院 (Taipei) hold important materials.

The second half of this paper will consider specifically the late-Qing to the present situation of the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive, which is representative of the history

of local missionary archives during the mid-to-late twentieth century. Taiyuan's rich missionary archive is important because it holds rare materials related to the turbulent Sino-Western tensions of the Boxer Uprising 義和團運動 (1898-1900); in fact, consulting the Taiyuan diocesan archival materials reveals that the conflicts at Beijing's Legation Quarter were less intense than those that transpired in Shanxi's central plain. In essence, the discovery of a new missionary archive functions as a historical corrective to the incorrect assertion that Beijing was the center of Sino-Western conflict. It is by consulting missionary archives, such as the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive, as well as local gazetteers, such as the *Shanxi fuzhi* 山西府志 (Administrative Gazetteer of Shanxi), that scholars begin to gain more accurate and balanced perspectives on the Sino-Western relations of the Ming and Qing dynasties. And as the Tang emperor, Tang Taizong 唐太 常 (r. 626-649), famously asserted, "Using the past as a mirror, one can understand what later arises" 以史為鏡, 可以志知興替.

## PART ONE Accessing Sino-Western History in Western Archives

Just as history is important to understanding our human past, archives are important to understanding history in general, and indeed learned persons of both China and the West have affirmed the importance of preserving historical documents. The founding emperor of the Tang 唐 (618-907), Li Shimin 李世民 (r. 626-649), who resided at Taiyuan before occupying the throne in Changan, famously asserted that, "Using the past as a mirror, one can understand what later arises" 以史為鏡, 可以志知興替.<sup>2</sup> This remark was echoed by Harvard philosopher, George Santayana (1863-1952), who declared that, "Those who forget the past are condemned to repeat it." From the scholarly point of view, accurate interpretations of the past are essential to accurate representations of that past, and with this in mind, academic research continues to rely on discovered or newly opened archival materials to function as a corrective to outdated, or worse, mistaken, narratives of the past. The growing popularity of revisionist histories of China's late-imperial era speaks to this point.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>2</sup> Quoted in 《舊唐書,魏徵傳》. For imperial histories I am consulting the very readable editions of the 二十五史(正史), published by 中華書局.

<sup>3</sup> Several revisionist histories in the field of Chinese history have been published, including Dorothy Ko's, *Cinderella's Slippers: A Revisionist History of Footbinding* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), and to some degree the work of Patricia Ebrey has functioned to correct previous assumptions regarding imperial China's social history. See Patricia Ebrey, *The Inner Quarters: Marriage and the Lives of Women in the Sung Period* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993).

One recent example shall serve to illustrate the value of corrective historiography. In Mary Wright's 1957 study of the Manchu rulers of the Qing 清 (1644-1911), The Last Stand of Chinese Conservatism, Wright argues that Manchu culture had become virtually "sinicized" by the middle of the nineteenth century. She contends that Manchu and Han Chinese interests were by then "virtually indistinguishable."<sup>4</sup> Challenging this contention, Evelyn Rawski notes that, "Mary Wright wrote during a period when the rich archival materials of the Qing dynasty were unavailable for scholarly use," and thus her arguments were largely based on outdated assumptions that the Manchus quickly assimilated into Chinese society after 1644.5 In the mid-1980s, the First Historical Archives in Beijing 北京中國第一歷史檔案館 opened the materials of the Imperial Household Department, which contains the documents produced by the Qing emperors themselves, in Manchu, their native language. Once these documents were consulted, historians discovered that, while presenting a patina of Han Confucian culture, the Manchus viewed themselves as culturally distinct from the Han Chinese, which, as Pamela Crossley and Evelyn Rawski assert, was largely demonstrated "in the mob actions against Manchus during the Taiping Rebellion and the 1911 Revolution."6 Once

<sup>4</sup> See Mary C. Wright, *The Last Stand of Chinese Conservatism: The T'ung-chih Restoration, 1862-1874* (Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1957); for a criticism of Wright's work see Pamela K. Crossley, *Orphan Warriors: Three Manchu Generations and the End of the Qing World* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990), especially pages 224-25.

 <sup>5</sup> Evelyn S. Rawski, *The Last Emperors: A Social History of Qing Imperial Institutions* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), 4.
 <sup>6</sup> Rawski, 4. these important archives were opened, scholars were able to correct previous assumptions of Manchu "sinicization," and affirm that, "the Qing rulers kept their Manchu identity."<sup>7</sup>

# New Insights on Late-Imperial Sino-Western History: Western Archives

Archival holdings likewise influence how we understand the history of Sino-Western relations, and as new sources come to light we are able to more accurately paint a picture of how imperial China responded to the imperialist West. Scholars who set out to study the history of China's long relationship with the West must bear in mind that western archives contain a large number of the documents recording that history. This is due to the particular character of Catholic missions in the Middle Kingdom; while the missioners were writing reports on Chinese culture and religion, and producing apologetic and scientific materials in Chinese, they were also accumulating native Chinese works and shipping them back to Europe. European libraries zealously built massive repositories of Chinese books on philosophy, religion, medicine, history, and art. In Wang Daocheng's 主道成 study of Beihai and Emperor Qianlong 乾隆 (r. 1735-1796),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Rawski, 4. For studies that support this point see, for example, Sun Wenliang, 孫文良 "Lun Qingchu Man Han minzu zhengce de xingcheng" 論清初滿漢民族政策的形成 (The Early Qing Development of Manchu and Han Ethnic Policies), *Liaoning daxue xuebao*, 遼寧大學學報 I (1991): 89-94,武田昌雄 Takeda Masao, *Man Kan reizoku* 滿 漢禮俗 (Manchu and Han Ritual Customs) (Dairen: Kinhodo shoten, 1935), and Wang Zhonghan, 王鐘翰 "Guanyu Manzu xingcheng zhong de jige wenti" 關於滿足形成中的 幾個問題 (Problems Concerning the Formation of the Manchu People), in *Manzu shi yanjiu ji* 滿族史研究集 (Accumulated Research on Manchu History) (Beijing 北京: Zhongguo shehui kexueyuan chubanshe, 中國社會科學院出版社 1998).

we learn that there was a Catholic church located within the imperial city during and after the eighteenth century, perhaps due to Jesuit confreres being enlisted to serve the court from the late Ming 明 (1368-1644) onward. One of the marks of the Jesuit order is its meticulous recordkeeping, document preservation, and bibliophilic collection of manuscripts and books. Starting from the late sixteenth century we already see large shipments of Chinese block-print books and Jesuit works on China being sent to European cities, especially the Vatican and Jesuit archives.

On March 6, 1581, during the rein of Emperor Wanli 萬曆 (r. 1572-1620), and the papacy of Gregory XIII (r. 1572-1585), the polymath, Michel de Montaigne (1533-1592), visited the Vatican library and was charmed by a Chinese book "in strange characters," produced on what he described as curiously absorbent and soft paper.<sup>8</sup> We can see here that Europe had already begun collecting and preserving Chinese texts as early as the Ming dynasty, texts that can still be accessed by scholars today in the twenty-first century. These archives contain the materials that allow researchers to gain a more precise understanding of Sino-Western history than has been previously represented.

The nature of Jesuit works is another important issue, and to date, most scholarship on the Jesuits in China has emphasized their scientific and technical efforts, though archival documents illustrate that this was only a minor portion of their overall work. In Zhang Xiping's, 張西平 study of Matteo Riici's, SJ, 利瑪竇 (1552-1610) life, *Following the Footsteps of Matteo Ricci in China*, for example, we see the Jesuit's work largely reduced to that of a scientific and philosophical advisor; almost nothing is said of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Anthony Grafton, "The Vatican and its Library," in *Rome Reborn*, ed. Anthony Grafton (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 3.

the bulk of his efforts, which were related to his religious objectives. Zhang asserts that Ricci's, "major task was entering the palace four times a year to repair chime clocks."<sup>9</sup>

Certainly, by reading Jesuit letters, books, and journal entries, we can get a better picture of their work than that they were merely scientists and cultural ambassadors who brought and repaired clocks. In my own research I have been able to reframe the early Jesuit mission in China based on archival documents held in European collections. Ricci's letters and journal entries are almost entirely spiritually motivated, and what technical matters he does mention are inexorably linked to his objectives as a missionary. After consulting the Vatican collection of Giulio Aleni's, SJ, 艾儒喀 (1582-1649) Chinese language publications, and those of his confreres, I have determined that the entire publication agenda of the Jesuits was related to their goal of conversion, and when considered as a whole, the majority of their Chinese writings were on religious topics rather than on scientific matters.<sup>10</sup> This might not surprise scholars who have perused the same archives, but this point has yet to be unambiguously articulated in scholarly works.

<sup>9</sup> Zhang Xiping, 張西平 Following the Footsteps of Matteo Ricci in China, Ding Deshu and Ye Jinping, trans. (Beijing 北京: Wuzhou chuanbo chuban, 五洲傳播出版 2006), 20.

<sup>10</sup> Indeed, the Jesuit mission attributed its successes in China to the wide publication of missionary books. Liam Brockey writes: "Knowing the voracious reading habits of his peers, Xu Guangqi had recommended that the missionaries print 'thirty thousand' copies of their works and distribute them throughout the empire. In this way, they would ensure that increasing numbers of literati found out about their teachings, helping the Jesuits to 'win friends and credit'." Liam Brockey, *Journey to the East: The Jesuit Mission to China, 1579-1724* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007), 80. Ricci's most famous convert, Xu Guangqi 徐光啟 (1562-1633), is an excellent example of how Jesuit

Looking at Aleni's twenty-two books published in China, we discover that seventeen were on theological or pastoral topics; only five dealt with non-religious topics. In one of his most read works, his widely published *Tianzhu jiangsheng yinyi* 夭 主降生引義 (Introduction to the Incarnation), Aleni cogently outlines the objective of the Jesuit mission in China, "My Lord Jesus can be seen and heard . . . And thus by the light of reason and faith you will not be beguiled" 吾主耶稣所見所聞. . . 姑知之明而信之無 惑.<sup>11</sup> We can see here that by accessing archival materials we gain a more accurate image of the past; documentary evidence attests that previous narratives of a Jesuit mission concerned mostly with scientific matters are incorrect. While many western countries host missionary archives that contain important documents related to the history of Sino-Western relations during the Ming and Qing eras, six archives stand out as particularly useful.

Bearing in mind that Protestant missionaries did not enter China until the nineteenth century, most archival missionary collections relevant to the Ming and Qing are managed by Catholic orders, namely the Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris

publication resulted in the conversion of some of China's most educated literati, for Xu's decision to convert was facilitated by his exposure to Ricci's *Tianzhu shiyi* 天主實義 (True Teachings of the Lord of Heaven).

<sup>11</sup> Giulio Aleni, 艾儒略 *Tianzhu jiangsheng yinyi* 天主降生引義 (Introduction to the Incarnation) (Fujian, 1635), (BAV), Borgia Cinese: 324, 5°, 77 *verso*. The Borgia Cinese is one of the Vatican's most exhaustive fonds, and contains extensive original versions of works by Matteo Ricci, Giulio Aleni, Xu Guanqi, and Yang Tingyun. One of the more interesting holdings in the Vatican archive is the edition of the Chinese-language Missal, translated and published by Ludovico Buglio, SJ, published in Beijing in 1670.

(MEP), the Congrègation de la Mission (CM or Lazarists), Pontificium Institutum Missionum Exterarum (PIME), the Order of Friars Minor (OFM), and the Vatican collections in the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana and the Archivio Segreto Vaticano. The Vatican's collection of China-related missionary materials is easily the largest on earth, and perhaps the best preserved.<sup>12</sup> The only non-ecclesial archive of similar stature is the Bibliothèque Nationale de France, which consists of both old and new facilities in Paris. After the U.S. Library of Congress, the Bibliothèque Nationale is the largest library in the world, and holds a significant collection of Catholic missionary materials from China's late-imperial era.

The Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris, nestled on the prominent ru du bac, has a remarkable collection of materials related to their mission in China starting from around 1660. The records held in this archive can help us to better understand France's entrance into the second Opium War in 1856, for it was the death of one of their China missionaries, Auguste Chapdelaine, MEP, 馬賴 (1814-1856), that functioned as the *cassus belli* of French involvement in that conflict.<sup>13</sup> A short walk from the archives of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> I should note here that the archives of the Propaganda Fide (known today as the Congregatio pro Gentium Evangelizatione), the missionary engine of the Catholic Church, also contains a substantial collection of documents and rare objects related to the Catholic mission in China. During the Ming and Qing eras, however, it was to the Vatican and Jesuit archives that the Jesuits sent their shipments, and thus any research conducted on Sino-Western history in Europe should begin in the Vatican; though the repository at the Propoganda Fide should by no means be overlooked.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> For an account of Auguste Chapdelaine's life and martyrdom in China see, Anthony E. Clark, *China's Saints: Catholic Martyrdom During the Qing (1644-1911)* (Bethlehem: Lehigh University Press & Rowman and Littlefield, 2011). In addition to the materials on

the Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris, is the Congrègation de la Mission Archive, which holds a number of materials and images concerning western missionary activities in China. This archive is especially important because in 1783 the Lazarists were appointed to replace the Jesuits who had been suppressed by the Church hierarchy and ordered to leave China, largely as a result of the Rites Controversy (1630s-early 18<sup>th</sup> century). Any attempt to reconstruct an accurate history of the Sino-Western history of the late Qing can only gain a partial view of East-West relations without consulting the documents held in this archive. Many of the key participants during that time were Lazarist missionaries, such as Beijing's famous bishop, Pierre-Marie-Alphonse Favier-Duperron, CM, 集團權 (1837-1905). Favier's letters and personal diary are among the most valuable records available related to the Boxer incidents  $4\pi$  團 運動 (1898-1900), and his publications on the history and environs of Beijing during the late-Qing also value highly in our understanding of China at the end of nineteenth century.<sup>14</sup>

Not to be overlooked is the archive of the Pontificium Institutum Missionum Exterarum in Rome, which counts as one of the major sources for understanding the history of Sino-Western relations in areas outside of Beijing, especially letters and

Chapdelaine held at the archives of the Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris, copious documentation on his cause for canonization can be found in the *positio* and *processus*, located within the Vatican's Archivio Segreto Vaticano.

<sup>14</sup> See, for example, Pierre-Marie-Alphonse Favier, *Yanjing kaijiao lue* 燕京開教略 (Précis of the Origins of Catholicism in Beijing/Yanjing) (Beijing, 北京 1894); *The Heart of Pekin: Bishop A. Favier's Diary of the Siege, May-August 1900* (Boston: Marlier, 1901); and *Péking: Histoire et Description* (Paris, 1902).

journals of missionaries in northern China during the Boxer incidents of 1900.<sup>15</sup> Also in Rome is the remarkable archival collection of the Franciscan Curia, which boasts a large holding of ecclesial records on events that transpired mostly in northern China in Shanxi and Shaanxi. While the Franciscan mission to China commenced during the Yuan  $\pi$ (1271-1368) dynasty in 1294 when the friar John of Montecorvino, OFM, (1246-1328) arrived at the Mongol city of Khanbaliq (Beijing), the greatest amount of the Franciscan collection of China-related documents date to the late Qing, when the Order of Friars Minor maintained their most stable missions in the two Shanxi Provinces.<sup>16</sup> Like other missionary orders, Franciscans kept local archives in China; I shall discuss the archive of the Franciscan diocese of Taiyuan in the second half of this essay.

One of the best sources of archival materials on late-imperial Sino-Western history is the collection of Society of Jesus, held principally in the Jesuit archives of Rome and Vanves. Indeed, one of the prominent features of the Jesuit archives is its collection of documents that can help scholars better understand the so-called "accommodationist method" of Sino-Western interaction, or as it is known in Chinese, "wenhua shiying celüe," 文化適應策略 or "cultural adaptationism." It goes without

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Perhaps the most valuable documents held in the archive are the personal writings of Alberico Crescitelli, PIME, a member of this congregation who died during the Boxer Uprising. For a general account of Crescitelli's life during the late-Qing, see Guglielmo Mencaglia, *Il beato P. Alberico Crescitelli : martire della Cina* (Milan: Pontificio Istituto Missioni Estere, 1950).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> For information relevant to the Franciscan mission in China the best accounts were produced by Johannes Ricci, OFM, himself a missioner in northern China: see for example, Johannes Ricci, OFM, *Vicariatus Taiyuanfu seu Brevis Historia: Antiquae Franciscanae Missionis Shansi et Shensi* (Beijing: Congregationis Missionis, 1929).

saying that before western diplomatic or trade relations existed with China, the Jesuits were making inroads into Chinese land and society, and thus China's first late-imperial contact with the West was with Jesuit confreres such as Matteo Ricci, Johann Adam Schall von Bell, SJ, 湯若堂 (1592-1666), Ferdinand Verbiest, SJ, 南懷仁 (1623-1688), and Giulio Aleni. The correspondences, published works, and official reports of these early westerners in China are held in the Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (ARSI), located near the Vatican in Rome. This collection and the French Jesuit archive in Vanves contain China-related materials dating from the late Ming to the present, and one of the most important resources in these repositories is the collection of *Litterae Annuae*, or the "annual letters" sent to Europe each year by the Jesuit missionaries in China, letters that describe in detail important matters related to Sino-Western history.<sup>17</sup>

The largest western collection of materials related to Sino-Western history is preserved in the Vatican's Papal and Secret Archives, and it is a common mistake to assume that the Vatican's collection holds only documents related to the Catholic enterprise in China. It also has a very large assembly of rare Chinese classics, including precious editions of the *Yijing* 易經 (Classic of Changes), *Shijing* 詩經 (Classic of Poetry), *Zuozhuan* 左傳 (Commentary of Mr. Zuo), *Lunyu* 論語 (Analects), *Ershiwushi* =+五史 (Twenty-Five Dynastic Histories), and other such works. One of the most notable assemblies in the Vatican archive, however, is the Borgia Cinesi collection,

<sup>17</sup> For a helpful description of the ARSI collection one might consult the paper by Robert Danieluk, SJ, "Michał Boym, Andrzej Rudomina, and Jan Smogulecki, Three 17<sup>th</sup>-Century Missionaries in China: A Selection of Documents from the Roman Jesuit Archives," delivered at a conference in Cracow, in September 2009. This essay is scheduled to be published by the *Monumenta Serica*.

which holds most of the western works published by Catholic missionaries in Ming and Qing China; examples of variant editions of the same text are kept together so scholars can easily compare recensions. Naturally, anyone wishing to understand the history of Sino-Western relations must consult Chinese archives, which boast some of the most important collections assembled, and as these archives gradually open to scholarly use we are gaining new insights into the long relationship between the Chinese court and western missionaries.

# New Insights on Late-Imperial Sino-Western History: Chinese Archives

Perhaps the most important Chinese archive to have opened for scholarly use in recent decades is the First Imperial Archive in Beijing, and one good example of a new history based on this collection is Dong Jianzhong's 董建中 study of missionary interactions with Qianlong, "Chuanjiaoshi jingong yu Qianlong huangdi de xiyang pinwei" 傳教士進貢與乾隆皇帝的西洋品味 (Missionary Tributes and Emperor Qianlong's Taste in western Objects).<sup>18</sup> In his paper, Dong was able, for the first time, to carefully analyze the emperor's reactions to the types of so-called "tribute" 進貢 items presented to the court by western missionaries, adding much to our previously oversimplified narrative, viz., that the Jesuits missioners earned the court's favor with elaborate clocks, clavichords, and star charts. In his use of these recently opened materials, Dong was able to describe Jesuit gift giving more accurately, "distinguish the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Dong Jianzhong's research was presented as a paper at Renmin University, Beijing, at an academic conference entitled, "Interaction & Exchange: An International Symposium on Westerners & the Qing Court (1644-1911)," October 2008, sponsored by the University of San Francisco's Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History.

vicissitudes of missionary favor and disfavor during their interaction with the court"可以 看作傳教士與清帝關係的一個晴雨表.<sup>19</sup>

Until the mid-twentieth century, China's most active Catholic mission was in Shanghai, and thus the Shanghai Municipal Archives 上海市檔案館 also holds an impressive collection of letters, records, and photographs of the late-imperial Catholic mission there. But by far the most exhaustive collection of Ming-Qing missionary materials is held in the former Jesuit library at Xujiahui, 徐家匯圖書館 now connected to the Shanghai Municipal Library 上海市圖書館. The Xujiahui library was built in 1847 and quickly acquired over 200,000 works, including local Chinese gazetteers, 地方志 periodicals, and mission-related materials that can shed light on the history of Sino-Western interaction. The Xujiahui's last Jesuit director was Xu Zongze, SJ, 徐宗澤 (1886-1947), under whose management the library assembled one of China's largest collections of Qing gazetteers, records which hold important accounts of Sino-Western interactions.<sup>20</sup> This meant that the Xujiahui Library was perhaps the best place in China

<sup>20</sup> For a survey of the history of the Xujiahui Library and its collections, see Gail King, "The Xujiahui (Zikawei) Library of Shanghai, *Libraries and Culture*, Vol. 32, No. 4 (Fall 1997): 456-469. Also see *Xujiahui jinxi: tupian teji* 徐家匯今昔:圖片特輯 (Xujiahui Then and Now: A Pictorial History) (Hong Kong: Holy Spirit Study Center, 1992). Also, for Xu Zongzi's excellent study of Jesuit publication in China, a project he completed while directing the Xujiahui Library, see Xu Zongze, SJ, 徐宗澤 *Ming-Qing jian* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Dong Jianzhong, , "Chuanjiaoshi jingong yu Qianlong huangdi de xiyang pinwei" 傳教 士進貢與乾隆皇帝的西洋品味 (Missionary Tributes and Emperor Qianlong's Taste in Western Objects), "Interaction & Exchange: An International Symposium on Westerners & the Qing Court (1644-1911)" (October 2008), 13.

where both Chinese and western materials could be consulted in one place. After the last Jesuiţs had left China in the early 1950s, the Xujiahui Library was placed under the control of the Shanghai Municipal Library, and after roughly a decade of closure was reopened in 1977. This collection has undergone extensive reorganization and preservation in recent years, and is today an excellent location to research Sino-Western history.

Another important collection of missionary records and books is currently held in Beijing's Guojia tushuguan 國家圖書館 (National Library of China). As Gail King has noted in her brief description of Jesuit-related libraries in China, the Flemish Jesuit, Nicolas Trigault, SJ, 金尼閣 (1577-1628) brought a large number of secular and religious books to China in 1620, which were used to begin the large collection of western books in the Beitang 北堂 (North Church) library. The contents of this library were relocated to the National Library of China in the 1950s, and at least two catalogues of the former library's contents have been produced; unfortunately this collection is still closed, and cannot yet be consulted. In addition to the collections I have already mentioned, the National Central Library 國家圖書館台北 and the Academia Sinica Archive, 中央研究 院 both located in Taipei, hold important documents related to western missionaries in China. As these archives continue to open their collections, and as scholars continue to consult them, important new discoveries enrich our historical understanding of Sino-

yesuhuishi yizhu tiyao 明清間耶穌會士譯著提要 (Summary of Jesuit Publications During the Ming and Qing Dynasties) (Shanghai 上海: Shanghai shudian chubanshe 上海書店出版社, 2006).

western history: new books are being published that both confirm and correct previous works that could not yet benefit from these sources.

#### PART TWO

Assessing Sino-Western History Based on Taiyuan's Diocesan Materials

# Taiyuan's Late-Imperial Sino-Western History: Extant Scholarship

In his recent study of Taiyuan history, Qin Geping 秦格平 dedicates an entire chapter to the history of the Boxer incidents in Shanxi. He writes: "In terms of Shanxi Province, more than four thousand Catholics died within the short time of a few months. In Shanxi's northern area, in Taiyuan, the death toll reached three thousand, which counts as an extremely significant missionary incident" 以山西而言,僅在短短幾個月內,既 殺死交友四千餘人。山西北境(太原)教區被殺者遇三千,成為一機大教難.<sup>21</sup> Most previous studies of the Yihetuan era have centered on the conflicts at Beijing's foreign legations, and Qin's assertion draws historical attention away from the capital, suggesting that the focus of the conflicts was not, in fact, in Beijing. Qin continues to discuss Boxer incidents in Shanxi for eight more pages, largely citing local gazetteers, though at the time he wrote his book he had no access to the diocesan archives of Taiyuan, which contain significant original documents outlining the events of that time.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>21</sup> Qin Geping 秦格平 Taiyuan jiaoqu jianhua 太原教區簡話 (Taiyuan,太原 2010), 318.
<sup>22</sup> Perhaps the best source for local gazetteers and personal comments on the Yihetuan Movement in Shanxi, produced immediately after the conflicts, is *Yihetuan zai Shanxi diqu shi cailiao* 義和團在山西地區史材料 (Local Historical Materials on the Yihetuan of Shanxi), ed. Qiao Zhiqiang 喬志強 (Taiyuan 太原: Shanxi renmin chubanshe 山西人民出版社, 1980). A more recent publication that includes gazetteer excerpts related to Christianity in Shanxi is *Zhongguo difangzhi: Jidujiao shiliao jiyao* 中國地方誌:基督教石料輯要 (Chinese Gazetteers: A Collection of Historical Documents Related to

By consulting the materials produced by the Franciscan missionaries who managed the Taiyuan Diocese, we gain a more complete picture of what happened in Shanxi during the summer months of 1900. By looking at the Franciscan materials we are able to see firsthand the records produced by witnesses and participants, rather than rely mostly on older narratives based on sources more removed from the actual events. As we recover archival materials in China produced by missionaries and compare them to official Chinese accounts, and to documents held in western archives, we are able to check previous assumptions and revise outdated narratives.

In this section of my essay I shall describe the status of present archival collections related to the missionary history of Taiyuan during the late-Qing, including the newly-discovered documents of the Archives of the Diocese of Taiyuan, 天主教太原 教區檔案館 and end with an outline of how a more precise history of the Sino-Western history of Taiyuan can be produced based on these collections. My present book project is concerned with the Boxer incidents of Shanxi in 1900, thus I will center my remarks here on the collection of Shanxi missionary materials related to the late-Qing. Fundamentally, my objective is to update previous accounts of Taiyuan's Boxer incidents, such as Qin Geping's narrative, which focuses mostly on religious conflict and Boxer violence, rather than on the social, political, and economic antecedents to those conflicts. So far I have consulted information primarily from six sources: (1) the Vatican's two major archives (Vatican City), (2) the Franciscan Archive (Rome), (3) the Archive of the Franciscan Missionaries of Mary (Rome), (4) Protestant missionary letters held at the

Christianity), eds. Zhang Xianqing and Zhao Ruijuan 趙蘂娟 (Shanghai 上海: Dongfang chuban zhongxin, 東方出版中心 2010).

Oberlin College and University of Oregon Archives (U.S.), (5) oral testimonies provided by descendants of witnesses of the Boxer Uprising (Taiyuan), and finally, (6) the Archives of the Diocese of Taiyuan (Taiyuan).

# Taiyuan Archival Materials: Local and Abroad

Sino-Western relations began a precipitous decline after the signing of the Treaty of Nanjing in 1842, which ended the first Opium War (1839-1842) 鴉片戰爭 and began what western historian's often refer as China's "century of shame," 百年國毕 which lasted until 1949. After the Treaty of Nanjing, missionaries established missions even more deeply into China's interior; though, after the establishment of the People's Republic of China, foreign missionary work ended in China, and as Li Jianhua notes in his study of Catholic archives in China, written several years ago, "the vast majority of pre-1949 materials preserved in Church archives has been destroyed."<sup>23</sup> As has been disclosed by Jin Luxian, the bishop of Shanghai, and Li Shan, the bishop of Beijing, the diocesan archives of Beijing and Shanghai, for example, were extinguished during the mid-1960s. Li's essay, entitled "Saving History," calls for a twofold effort to preserve missionary records in Mainland China; first he recommends that all surviving materials be urgently collected and preserved, and second, that archival work related to lateimperial missionary documents be promoted so that future generations may better

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Li Jianhua, "Saving History: The Urgent Need for Collecting Historical Data on the Catholic Church in China," unpublished manuscript (no date), 1. This reality was confirmed in my most recent correspondences with Bishop Jin Luxian, of Shanghai, and Bishop Li Shan, of Beijing.

understand and learn from that history.<sup>24</sup> Fortunately, good progress has been made toward these goals in recent years.

One excellent example of recently recovered archival collections related to Catholic mission history in China is the Archives of the Archdiocese of Guangzhou (Canton), 天主教廣州總教區檔案館 which contains approximately 15,000 items – documents, maps, plans, rare photographs, and other artifacts – discovered and preserved by the Ricci Institute at the University of San Francisco. These materials date from 1851 to 1949, and promise to provide new insights into such historical events as the Boxer Uprising and Sino-Western tensions around the mid-twentieth century. In addition to this important collection of materials is the archival repository of the Catholic Diocese of Tianjin 天津教區檔案館; this is the only Catholic archive in China to have entirely survived destruction during the mid-to-late twentieth century.<sup>25</sup> As I write this essay, both the Guangzhou archival collection in the United States and the Tianjin archive in China await final organization and cataloging before they are opened for scholarly use. We can

# <sup>24</sup> Li, 1.

<sup>25</sup> As of this writing, the Catholic Diocese of Tianjin Archive 天津教區檔案館 is in disrepair. I have myself surveyed the state of this collection, which as Li Jinahua has cogently noted, "keeps several thousands of books and documents published before 1949." Li continues: "Of all the dioceses in China that I have visited, this is where the largest diocesan collection of documents may be found. Unfortunately, they remain sealed away in storage, untouched." Li, 4. While discussing the future of this collection with the cathedral rector, two principal concerns exist among the local Catholic community in Tianjin: first, that the materials be properly preserved and cataloged, and second, that they remain within the care of the local Church. They are concerned that foreign archives and libraries pressure them into surrendering their collection.

hope that future discoveries similarly emerge, and even more missionary records are made available to scholars.

Perhaps one of the most important collections to surface in recent years is the cache of materials from the Archive of the Diocese of Taiyuan, and the history of its discovery is quite interesting. Once the remaining Italian missionaries were deported from Taiyuan in 1950, the diocesan materials of the Franciscan mission were confiscated by local authorities and relocated to the Provincial Archives of Shanxi 山西省檔案局. Unfortunately, since the archival staff there was unable to read the materials written in foreign languages, the decision was made to dispose of the materials. Before discarding the diocesan archive, however, a local priest was contacted and offered the collection. The priest was only able to retrieve one of the archival containers; the remaining majority of diocesan records were regrettably destroyed. The materials saved, however, are quite important.

As Li Jianhua notes in his essay, "To date, the [diocesan] archive has not been cataloged," but during my last visit to the Taiyuan archival collection, I was able to compile a general outline of the archival holdings.<sup>26</sup> What was salvaged were ninetythree folders, some containing several hundred letters; eighty-four of these files hold correspondence from diocesan priests to the bishop, seven folders contain letters between the Diocese of Taiyuan and other ecclesiastical territories, and two folders reserve letters

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Li, 7. The present locations and status of the archive is not well known; the materials are tenderly preserved in an undisclosed facility in Shanxi Province. The principal task at hand is to produce a thorough catalog of the archive's contents, though open scholarly access to the collection remains a sensitive issue.

from seminarians.<sup>27</sup> The primary languages are Latin and Italian, though there are some materials in Chinese, French, English, and German. Among the more significant items in this collection are: a late-Qing dynasty passport issued to a foreign priest; documents related to Chinese virgins who were employed teach catechism to converts and catechists; records recording internal church politics; and an account of an entire village apostatizing.

One good example of what the archive preserves is a folder containing the correspondence and reports of a Chinese priest named Paul Zhang (or Paulus Tchang). In this file are contained the letters and reports written by Zhang, who was both the apostolic procurator in the Diocese of Taiyuan, and the director of the large orphanage at the Catholic village of Dongergou, where the Franciscan residence and seminary was located.<sup>28</sup> It is in such documents that we acquire a ground-level portrait of life in and around a thriving Catholic mission during the late-imperial era. It is also through such records that we learn about Sino-Western interactions at a level outside of the more-often studied relationship between missionaries and the central court in Beijing.

The Taiyuan archive also provides new information regarding the status and administrative culture of foreign missionaries in the China's north central plain. One

<sup>28</sup> With the growing scholarly interest in the beatified nun, Sr. Maria Assunta, FMM, (1887-1903) who worked at Dongergou under the direction of Fr. Tchang, these letters shall be indispensible to understanding her life and context. One recent paper on Maria Assunta has in fact benefitted from documents held in the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive. See Henrietta Harrison, "Catholic Missions, Medicine and Miracles in Rural North China: The Story of Assunta Pallotta," American Historical Association Annual Meeting, New York, 5 January 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Li provides a similar account of the archive's contents in his essay, "Saving History," especially pages 7-8.

example from the Taiyuan collection might serve to illustrate this point. In one file containing documents dating mostly to the late Qing, we find a formal petition from a Catholic woman named Maria Xing, 辛瑪利亞 written to a Fr. Zhao 道神父 asking for employment. What is most curious about this petition is that it is formally drafted and presented in the same format that one would present an appeal to a local governor at an official provincial yamen 衙門巡撫. In the petition, Maria recounts how a feud between her and another group Chinese Catholics developed after she had reported their gossip to the local chancery.

The gist of her request to Fr. Zhao is located in this passage:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> "Petition to Fr. Zhao from Maria Xing," Archive of the Diocese of Taiyuan, ca. late Qing (Taiyuan, China).

實在的說,他說彭神父用人。我給你寫信,信來你就走。伏求大人,罪人不 敢去。罪人所倚靠的就是大人一個。罪人【望?】大人給罪人尋一個教書的 本分,不知能不能。如能,罪人等的.不能的時候,天主堂的本分。 I spoke frankly with Fr. Guo, who said, 'Fr. Peng needs someone. I shall write him a letter, and once his reply arrives you can go.' I implore you, sir. I dare not go. I [can] rely on you alone, sir. I wish that you, sir, can locate a teaching job for me; would that be possible? If so, I can wait. If not, perhaps [you can provide] a position in your parish?<sup>30</sup>

Scholars can learn several things from such a document.

First, we can observe firsthand how China's foreign missionaries employed a parallel system of jurisprudence, albeit intra-ecclesial, wherein the priest functioned largely in the same capacity as a Chinese magistrate. Indeed, priests were petitioned in much the same fashion, and with a rhetoric that utilized similar terminology, as the system employed to approach court-appointed magistrates. The fact that foreign priests were given official ranks, could wear the official regalia of a Qing official, and were addressed in a similar manner as local governors, was indeed one of the principal causes of Sino-Western tension during the mid-to-late Qing. Documents such as Maria Xing's petition also provide additional clarity regarding the inner politics of Shanxi's Catholic mission.

I shall end with a brief example of how one might combine archival and other sources to reconstruct a more accurate, and often corrective, account of a historical era or event, using Taiyuan during the Boxer era as my locus. Since the Vatican's Congregation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> "Petition to Fr. Zhao from Maria Xing."

for the Causes of Saints has a particular interest in the history of martyrdom, a significant collection of documents are held in the Vatican's archives related to the deaths of Catholics in Shanxi during the summer months of 1900. These files contain the transcripts of oral interviews with witnesses, collected accounts from subsequent correspondences, and copious records pertaining to the personal biographies of those who have been, are, or shall be under consideration for beatification or canonization. The Vatican documents on Shanxi's Franciscan mission are principally in Latin, but some Chinese files are interspersed.<sup>31</sup> It is important to note that these documents are not limited to the records of foreign missionaries; in fact most of the records deal with the lives of native Chinese Catholics, many of whom were tertiary Franciscans, such as Zhang Banniu, 張板舞 Shen Jihe, 中計和 Feng De, 馮德 and Wu Anbang, 武安邦.<sup>32</sup>

Two other archives in Rome contain large collections of materials related to the Catholic mission at Shanxi during the turn of the nineteenth century into the twentieth. The first is the archive of the congregation of Missionary women, the Franciscan

<sup>32</sup> A more complete list of the Chinese native Christians who have exhaustive files at the Archivio Segreto Vaticano includes: Zhang Banniu, 張板紐 Shen Jihe, 申計和 Feng De, 馮徳 Wu Anbang, 武安邦 Zhang Jingguang, 張景光 Zhang Zhihe, 張志和 Zhang Huan, 張煥 Dong Bodi, 董博第 Wang Rui, 王銳 Zhao Quanxin, 趙全信 Chen Ximan, 陳西滿 Yan Guodong, 閭國棟 and Wang Erman 王二满.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> There exists an embargo on documents held in the Archivio Segreto Vaticano which prohibits the consultation of files that date after the end of the papacy of Pius XI (February 1939), but files predating the embargo may be freely accessed by scholars who have made arrangements with the appointed prefect. The *processus* related to the Franciscan martyrs, for example, are catalogued as *Congr. Riti. Processus* 4623-4624, and so forth.

Missionaries of Mary (FMM), which operated the orphanage and dispensary for the Diocese of Taiyuan. Among the more important materials in the FMM repository are the letters written by missionary women that record Sino-Western tensions as they developed in Shanxi from 1899 to 1900. Particularly poignant are the reports by the French Superior of Taiyuan's Maison Saint-Pascal Baylon, where seven nuns lived before their deaths in the magistrate's yamen on June 9, 1900. These reports, by Mother Marie Hermine de Jesus (Irma Grivot), FMM, 埃明納 (1866-1900) include a vivid image of how European women missionaries interacted with the native population of Shanxi, and her final letters are important to understanding the religious and political misunderstandings that precipitated the Boxer incidents. The FMM archive also contains several historic photographs of Taiyuan during the late Qing, as well as official decrees posted by the local magistrate in 1900.

Another Roman archive to house documents related to Shanxi's late-imperial Catholic mission is the repository of the Order of Friars Minor (OFM). Other than a rich array of historic photographs, Chinese documents, and personal objects that belonged to clergy and lay Christians, this archive contains the copious records of Giovanni Ricci, OFM, (1875-1941), who spent two decades living in China and collecting important records in Shanxi province. Riccis' works include *Barbarie e trionfi: Ossia le vittime illustri del Sansi in Cina nella persecuzione del 1900* (1909), *Chinese Martyrs of 1900: Tertiaries of St. Francis* (published posthumously in 1955), *Franciscan Martyrs of the Boxer Rising* (1932), *Hierarchia Francisciana in Sinis* (1929).<sup>33</sup> Also included in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> See Giovanni (John) Ricci, OFM, Barbarie e trionfi: Ossia le vittime illustri del Sansi in Cina nella persecuzione del 1900, Second edition (Firenze: Associazioni Nazionale per

Ricci files are a number of historical images of Taiyuan city and the surrounding area, especially depicting missionary activities in Shanxi.

While my historical research centers on Shanxi's Catholic mission, Protestant missionaries, too, were active in and around Taiyuan, and the archives of Oberlin College (Oberlin, Ohio), perhaps, contain the largest collection of Protestant materials from that region. One of the largest, yet underutilized, collections of protestant missionary records from China is located in the Special Collections at the University of Oregon. There I discovered a record of Taiyuan's June 9<sup>th</sup> incident that has until now remained in obscurity. The document is a letter from an American missionary, Dr. Charles Johnson, who met a man who had escaped the violence in Taiyuan with an eyewitness report of what had happened. The report was transmitted through a Chinese teacher from Shanxi. Eyewitness testimonies of these events, especially with such long and detailed narratives as this document contains, are critical to the historical narrative.<sup>34</sup>

Soccorrere I Missionary Cattolici Italiani, 1910); *Chinese Martyrs of 1900: Tertiaries of St. Francis* (Melbourne: The Australian Catholic Truth Society, 1955); *Franciscan Martyrs of the Boxer Rising* (Dublin: Franciscan Missionary Union, 1932); and *Hierarchia Francisciana in Sinis* (Wuchang: Ex Typographia Franciscana, 1929). Also, for a general survey of the Franciscan mission in China see Arnulf Camps, OFM, and Pat McCoskey, OFM, *The Friars Minor in China (1294-1955), Especially the Years 1925-55* (St. Bonaveture, NY: Franciscan Institute, 1995).

<sup>34</sup> This document may be accessed at the University of Oregon Special Collections, Knight Library, "Charles F. Johnson Files," Box I, beginning on folio page 66. The document is a transcription of Dr. Charles F. Johnson's outgoing correspondence, and only this passage is relevant to the Shanxi Incident of 1900. The event is recounted in a letter dated September 13, 1900, though the addressee is undisclosed as the cover of the The final and most important stage of this research example consists of the collection of materials in Shanxi itself, viz., the accumulation of information in two primary areas related to Taiyuan's missionary enterprise in late-Qing China. The first area is the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive, which contains the letters and personal records I have described above. The archive also contains the documented account of several steles that were erected in the wake of the Boxer incidents, most of which were presumed lost during the 1960s and 70s. Fortunately, these inscriptions have been transcribed and recorded in archival files. Taiyuan's archival records preserve the inscriptions of five steles, three of which have been found and I have photographed.<sup>35</sup> The longest stele inscription of the Taiyuan Boxer conflicts was located in Taiyuan's public cemetery, and was destroyed in the 1960s. This stele was fortunately photographed, and its narrative was preserved in the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive.

What we learn from these steles and archival documents is that, as one inscription notes, the Bagua 八卦 (Eight Trigram) and Bailian 白蓮 (White Lotus) societies,

letter is missing. I presume the letter's date is September 12 or 13 since it is located between correspondences dating to September 11 and 14, respectively. <sup>35</sup> In addition to the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive, transcriptions of the five steles are scattered in various locations in Shanxi. Three of the steles are presently located in Guchengying, 古城營 where a Boxer attack in 1900 destroyed the village church, killing most of the people inside who attempted to defend the parish property. There were originally four steles at Guchengying, but as Qin Geping records, "There were four martyr steles at Guchengying.... Among them was the Yan family stele, which has not yet been located" 古城營致命碑共有四塊。。。其中姓閏至今未找到. Qin, 344-345. During my most recent visit to Guchengying (summer 2010) I was informed that the three remaining steles were to be installed in a monument pavilion dedicated to the martyrs of the village. "changed their name to Yihetuan (Fists of Righteous Harmony) during the *gengzi* reign year (1900) of Emperor Guanxu, and in actuality [the Yihetuan] derived from the Bagua and Bailian societies" 至庚子改名義和團,實自蓮八卦教之流.<sup>36</sup> This and other materials from this era suggest that the Yihetuan movement was likely derived from Bailian and Bagua societies, which were suppressed by the Qing court.<sup>37</sup> Official gazetteers from the late-Qing are reluctant to note this, as the court had previously condemned the societies that they were later collaborating with.

In addition to the inscription of the stele located at Taiyuan's public cemetery, the Taiyuan Archive also preserves the entire text of the Yangjiapu Village stele, which also provides an informative narrative of the incidents of 1900. Since this archive contains the texts of these five steles, as well as several rare photographs of them, scholars could add much to their historical understanding of Sino-Western relations during the late-imperial era. To supplement the archival documents in the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive and the

<sup>37</sup> This new evidence contradicts the assertion of Dai Xuanzhi, who argues that the Boxers (Yihetuan) bore no historical relationship to Bailian and Bagua societies. As Scott Colby suggests, "Dai's theory is that the Boxers originated in 1853 when a Ch'ing edict called for the organization of local militia to resist the Taipings." Scott Dearborn Colby, "The Boxer Crisis as Seen Through the Eyes of Five Chinese Officials" (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1976), 132, n. 1. For Dai's original argument see Dai Xuanxhi 戴玄之, *Yihetuan yanjiu* 義和團研究 (Taipei 臺北: Zhongguo xueshu 中國學書, 1963), especially pages 10-16, 37-40, 73-76.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Taiyuan Diocese Archive transcription of "the memorial stele no. 1 at Guchengying," 古城營第一塊石碑 also in Qin, 341. I have also obtained a copy of this transcription from the villagers of Guchengying, and have photographed the stele.

local gazetteers, I have also collected oral testimonies from descendants of chief participants in the events of the Boxer Uprising.

To reiterate my principal assertions, an accurate historical understanding of Sino-Western interactions in Shanxi during the late Qing must rely on the following sources, most of which are derived from missionary materials:

- 1. Materials from the Archivio Segreto Vaticano (Latin and Chinese)
- 2. Materials from the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana (Latin and Chinese)
- 3. Materials from the OFM Archive (Italian, Latin, and Chinese)
- 4. Materials from the FMM Archive (French, Italian, Latin, and Chinese)
- Materials from the Shanxi Protestant mission held in such places as Oberlin Colege, Yale University, and the University of Oregon (English and Chinese).
- 6. Materials from local Chinese records, such as the Shanxi fuzhi 山西府志 (Shanxi Administrative Gazetteer) (Chinese).
- 7. Materials from the Taiyuan Diocesan Archive (Italian, Latin, and Chinese).
- 8. Historical inscriptions on late-Qing steles (Chinese).
- 9. Oral testimonies from local Chinese (Chinese).

Navigating through such a diversity of languages and visiting such a large number of archives and countries is indeed a daunting enterprise for even the most adventurous scholar, but the reward of historical understanding is, I suggest, worth the effort. When scholars travel between cultures they become cultural bridges, and develop ties of friendship between China and the West. As scholars work together to better understand the history of Sino-Western relationships, we begin to more clearly understand our past successes and failures, and we continue to understand each other better. I think Matteo Ricci's famous work, *Jiaoyoulun* 交友論 (Essay on Friendship), expresses well the benefits of such work:

友之與我,雖友二身,二身之內,其心一而已. 利瑪竇

(My friend and I, even though we have two bodies, that which is within us both, is the same heart. Matteo Ricci)<sup>38</sup>

Let us, as scholars who wish to "save history," strive for a better and more accurate understanding of the past, so that we may develop deeper ties of friendship, and acquire "the same heart" that Matteo Ricci has so beautifully described.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> In Matteo Ricci, *Jiaoyoulun* 交友論 (Essay on Friendship) (Shanghai 上海: Shangwu yinshuguan 商務印書館,民國 25 [1936]). In the series Congshu jicheng chubian 叢書 集成初編, "本館據寶顏堂祕芨本排印初編各叢書僅有此本."